Process for Evaluating Nominations for Library Employee Excellence Awards

Each year nominations are open online for a period of three weeks. All members of the Employee Recognition Committee automatically receive copies of each nomination, and the committee chair logs in all nominations in an Excel spreadsheet as they come in. A separate spreadsheet contains the nominations arranged by award category.

Evaluation of nominations is done in two stages. Because of the large number of submissions each year, the initial evaluation is done by the Employee Recognition Committee (12 members). Committee members collectively decide on a slate of nominations to present to the deans. The deans can read and review any nomination but generally work from the slate sent forward by the committee. The committee strives to advance three to four nominations in each award category, so that the deans have between 18 and 24 nominations to review. Decisions on awards are made by the deans.

The committee's review begins upon close of nominations. All committee members read the evaluation criteria for each award category and then review all nominations. Members rank their top three nominations in each award category. At a meeting of the committee, members discuss all nominations and carry their rankings to a master spreadsheet.

Following discussion, the committee identifies and advances the three highest ranking nominations in each category (or four when results are close). In determining which nominations to advance, committee members review the achievements and contributions noted in nominations, look at the total number of times nominations were ranked in the top three by members, and calculate their overall ranking. The example below shows how the twelve members ranked five nominations – each member ranking the three they felt were the strongest in the category. Nomination "A" was ranked by 10 members, with an overall rank of 1.60. Nominations "C" and "E" tied in overall rank, with "E" receiving more overall rankings and more rankings of "1."   These three nominations would be put forward to the deans. The deans receive a copy of the original nomination along with the committee vote count for that nomination, but not the rank, which is only used internally by the Employee Recognition Committee. The document forwarded to the deans is written by the committee chair and reviewed by all members prior to being sent.

Number	Rank	Nominee	Category												
10	1.60	A		1	1	1		2	1	2	3		1	1	3
4	2.25	B		2			2	3	2						
7	2.00	C			2	3	1				2	1	3		2
5	2.60	D				2			3	3		2		3	
10	2.00	E		3	3		3	1		1	1	3	2	2	1